Trauma among Women Living With HIV
Understanding its rates and impact

Beyond Compassion: Caring for Women with a History of Trauma
HIVE Symposium
May 2, 2016

Edward Machtinger, MD
Professor of Medicine
Director, Women’s HIV Program
University of California, San Francisco
Edward.machtinger@ucsf.edu

Photo by Lynnly Labovitz; used with artist and patient permission
The Women’s HIV Program at UCSF

One of the first programs in country for WLHIV
Female-focused services provided in a “one-stop shop”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary Care</th>
<th>Gynecology</th>
<th>Obstetrics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacy program</td>
<td>Social Work</td>
<td>Case Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Therapy/Psychiatry</td>
<td>Breakfast</td>
<td>Partner agencies in clinic</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Patients

- Mostly African American or Latina (20% White). 15% transgender women
- 15-71 years old
- Marginally housed, low income
- Medically and psycho-socially complex
Recent Deaths at WHP

1. Rose murder
2. Amy murder
3. Patricia suicide
4. Regina suicide
5. Vela suicide
6. Iris addiction/overdose
7. Mary addiction/organ failure
8. Nadine addiction/lung failure
9. Lilly pancreatic cancer
10. Pebbles non-adherence

Photo by Lynnly Labovitz; used with artist and patient permission
Trauma

“... an event, series of events, or set of circumstances [e.g., physical, emotional and sexual abuse; neglect; loss; community violence, structural violence, war] that is experienced by an individual as physically or emotionally harmful or threatening and that has lasting adverse effects on the individual's functioning and physical, social, emotional, or spiritual well-being”.

A few more important definitions

**Complex Trauma**: repeated trauma, physically or emotionally (e.g., repeated childhood physical and/or sexual abuse, witnessing ongoing IPV, experiencing long-term IPV)

**PTSD**: includes 4 types of symptoms: 1) re-experiencing of the traumatic event(s); 2) avoidance of situations that remind you of the event; 3) negative changes in the way you think about yourself, other people or the world, and 4) feeling “keyed up”.

**Complex PTSD**: Includes all of the symptoms of PTSD + trouble regulating and handling emotions and relationships, and feelings low self-worth and powerlessness

Rates of trauma and PTSD in WLHIV are much higher

Meta-analysis of all studies among US WLHIV

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Pooled n</th>
<th>Prevalence (%)</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>Reference Prevalence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intimate Partner Violence</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2285</td>
<td>55.3</td>
<td>36.1 - 73.8</td>
<td>24.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Sexual Abuse</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3013</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>33.9 - 44.8</td>
<td>16.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Physical Abuse</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1582</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>31.5 - 54.4</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Abuse Unspecified</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>58.2</td>
<td>36.0 - 78.8</td>
<td>31.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime Sexual Abuse</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1182</td>
<td>61.1</td>
<td>47.7 - 73.8</td>
<td>12.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime Abuse Unspecified</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1065</td>
<td>71.6</td>
<td>61.0 - 81.1</td>
<td>39.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent PTSD</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>18.8 - 42.7</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

29 studies met our inclusion criteria, resulting in a sample of 5,930 individuals.

Rates of trauma and PTSD in WLHIV are much higher

Meta-analysis of all studies among US WLHIV

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Pooled n</th>
<th>Prevalence (%)</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>Reference Prevalence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intimate Partner Violence</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2285</td>
<td>55.3</td>
<td>36.1 - 73.8</td>
<td>24.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Sexual Abuse</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3013</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>33.9 - 44.8</td>
<td>16.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Physical Abuse</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1582</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>31.5 - 54.4</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Abuse Unspecified</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>58.2</td>
<td>36.0 - 78.8</td>
<td>31.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lifetime Sexual Abuse</strong></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1182</td>
<td><strong>61.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>47.7 - 73.8</strong></td>
<td><strong>12.0</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime Abuse Unspecified</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1065</td>
<td>71.6</td>
<td>61.0 - 81.1</td>
<td>39.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent PTSD</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>18.8 - 42.7</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rates of trauma and PTSD in WLHIV are much higher

Meta-analysis of all studies among US WLHIV

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Number of Studies</th>
<th>Pooled n</th>
<th>Prevalence (%)</th>
<th>95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>Reference Prevalence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intimate Partner Violence</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2285</td>
<td>55.3</td>
<td>36.1 - 73.8</td>
<td>24.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Sexual Abuse</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3013</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>33.9 - 44.8</td>
<td>16.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Physical Abuse</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1582</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>31.5 - 54.4</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childhood Abuse Unspecified</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>58.2</td>
<td>36.0 - 78.8</td>
<td>31.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime Sexual Abuse</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1182</td>
<td>61.1</td>
<td>47.7 - 73.8</td>
<td>12.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime Abuse Unspecified</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1065</td>
<td>71.6</td>
<td>61.0 - 81.1</td>
<td>39.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent PTSD</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>18.8 - 42.7</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recent Trauma ➔ 4x the rate of ART Failure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential factors</th>
<th>Detectable viral load on ART</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age (increase of one year)</td>
<td>OR 1.0 (0.93-1.1; p=.96)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African-American</td>
<td>OR 1.8 (0.6-6.1; p=.32)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transgender</td>
<td>OR 0.9 (0.2-3.2; p=.84)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD4 count &lt;200 cells/µl</td>
<td>OR 2.1 (0.7-6.5; p=.20)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt;90% ART adherence</td>
<td>OR 1.0 (0.3-3.6; p=.97)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depression</td>
<td>OR 0.8 (0.3-2.7; p=.78)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low self-efficacy</td>
<td>OR 1.7 (0.4-8.1; p=.50)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low social support</td>
<td>OR 2.2 (0.6-6.9; p=.18)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drug use</td>
<td>OR 1.1 (0.4-3.4; p=.88)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime coerced sex</td>
<td>OR 1.2 (0.4-3.8; p=.78)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recent coerced sex</td>
<td>OR 1.8 (0.3-12.0; p=.53)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime trauma</td>
<td>OR 1.2 (0.3-4.5; p=.77)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Recent trauma</strong></td>
<td><strong>Odds ratio 4.3</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>(1.1-16.6; p=.04)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The HIV Care Continuum in the United States, 2011.

IPV/recent trauma

- 3x more likely to wait >90 days*
- ≈ 2x rate of lost-to-follow
- ≈ 2X missed gyn appts
- ½ as likely on ART*
- 2x non-adherence+
- 2x non-adherence*
- 2-3x non-adherence*
- >1.3x rate of failure *
- >2x rate of failure
- >4x rate of failure

- * Includes both men and women
- + Meta-analysis
- ‡ Includes “Stressful Life Events

Siemieniuk RA, et al. AIDS Patient Care STDs. 2010*
Kalokhe, A.S., et al. AIDS Patient Care and STDs. 2012*
Hatcher, A.M., et al. AIDS. 2015 *
Lesserman, J. et al. AIDS PATIENT CARE and STDs. 2008*

Mugavero M, et al. Barriers to antiretroviral adherence: the importance of depression, abuse, and other traumatic events. AIDS patient care and STDs. 2006 Jun;20*


The HIV Care Continuum in the United States, 2011.

Lifetime trauma ➔

1.7 greater odds of not being on HAART when medically indicated

Significant association of numbers of lifetime traumas and ART nonadherence: OR 1.14, (95% CI 1.05, 1.25)] ✫

Significant association of numbers of lifetime traumas and ART nonadherence: 1.13 (95% CI 1.03, 1.24) ✫

험 Includes both men and women

ⓘ bivariate data; association also significant on multivariate analysis

Percent of all People Living with HIV

100%  80%  60%  40%  20%  0%

HIV Diagnosed*  Linked to Care**  Engaged in Care***  Prescribed ART***  Virally Suppressed***
Impact of trauma on HIV outcomes off the continuum

Recent or lifetime trauma associated with:

• **HIV risk factors/HIV incidence**
  
  

• **Faster disease progression**
  
  
  Mugavero, MJ, et al. AIDS Patient Care STDS 2007 Sep;21(9):681-90. ] *
  

• **More hospitalizations**
  

• **Almost twice the rate of death***
  

* Study included both men and women
Trauma and Health: its not just HIV

The ACE Study

- 17,000 patients completed surveys about 10 categories of childhood abuse, neglect and family dysfunction
- Compared answers to an array of current health behaviors and conditions
- Conclusion: ACEs are common; and are strong predictors of later health risks and disease

The ACE Study: Key Findings

- 64% reported at least one ACE category
- 12.5% (one in six) reported four or more
- 25% of women and 16% of men reported having experienced childhood sexual abuse

Individuals who reported four or more ACE categories had:

- 2x rate of lung and liver disease
- 3x the rate of depression
- > 3x times the rate of alcoholism
- > 4x rate of intimate partner violence and >5x rate of rape
- 11 times the rate of intravenous drug use
- 14 times the rate of attempting suicide

Adult Trauma & PTSD ➔ Poor health

**Associated with IPV:**
*(partial list)*
- Cardiovascular disease
- Gastrointestinal disorders
- Musculoskeletal disease
- High-risk sexual activities
- Chronic pain
- Suicide attempts
- PTSD
- Inadequate social support
- Depression
- Substance abuse
- Homelessness

**Associated with PTSD:**
*(partial list)*
- Cardiovascular disease
- Gastrointestinal disorders
- Musculoskeletal disease
- High-risk sexual activities
- Chronic pain
- Suicide attempts
- Risk of perpetration of violence
- Inadequate social support
- Depression
- Substance abuse
- Homelessness

National Center for PTSD. Department of Veteran's Affairs. [http://www.ptsd.va.gov/](http://www.ptsd.va.gov/)
Other determinates of poor outcomes

- Substance use
- Depression
- Stigma
- Social support
- Homelessness
- Poverty
- Uninsured
- Youth
- Racism
- Food insecurity
- Health literacy

Pink = associated with trauma and PTSD

Other determinates of poor outcomes

- Substance use
- Depression
- Stigma
- Social support
- Homelessness
- Poverty
- Uninsured
- Youth
- Racism
- Food insecurity
- Health literacy

Pink = associated with trauma and PTSD

The HIV Care Continuum in the United States, 2011.

- HIV Diagnosed: 86%
- Linked to Care: 80%
- Engaged in Care: 40%
- Prescribed ART: 37%
- Virally Suppressed: 30%

Ratios depicted are for illustrative purposes only and are not based on attributable risk data.
Ratios depicted are for illustrative purposes only and are not based on attributable risk data.
The HIV Care Continuum in the United States, 2011.

Ratios depicted are for illustrative purposes only and are not based on attributable risk data.
Now, women with HIV die from trauma more than HIV

**Women’s Interagency HIV Study**

By 2012, ≈ 17% deaths were AIDS-related*

**Women’s HIV Program at UCSF**

- Only 3/19 (16%) deaths over past decade were likely due to HIV/AIDS.
- Others: violence (2/19), suicide (3/19), substance abuse (5/19), cancer (2/19), lung disease (1/19), car accident (1/19), or unknown (2/19).

---

Personal Communication, Kathleen Weber, Women’s Interagency Study, October 9, 2015
Cocohoba, J, Chiarelli, B, Machtenger, E. 10th Conference on HIV Treatment and Prevention Adherence 2015
The rates and impact of trauma/PTSD on WLHIV in conclusion

• Very high prevalence of trauma and PTSD among WLHIV

• Both recent and lifetime trauma have direct impacts on most stages of the care continuum for both men and women, and on HIV morbidity and mortality

• Both recent and lifetime trauma and PTSD predispose men and women to the other key mutable determinates of poor outcomes on the care continuum

• Beyond the continuum, unaddressed trauma and PTSD lead to the most common causes of suffering and death for WLHIV

• Understanding this connection is actually really hopeful because there are many evidence-based approaches to help WLHIV heal from past trauma, prevent re-victimization and realize their inherent health and power.
Thank you for participating!